

A dynamical symmetry of the spherical dust collapse

Ujjal Debnath^{1*}, Subenoy Chakraborty^{1†} and Naresh Dadhich^{2‡}

¹*Department of Mathematics, Jadavpur University, Calcutta-32, India.*

²*Inter-University Centre for Astronomy and Astrophysics, Post Bag 4, Pune 411 007, India.*

(Dated: February 7, 2008)

By linearly scaling the initial data set (mass and kinetic energy functions) together with the initial area radius of a collapsing dust sphere, we find a symmetry of the collapse dynamics. That is, the linear transformation defines an equivalence class of data sets which lead to the same end result as well as its evolution all through. In particular, the density and shear remain invariant initially as well as during the collapse. What the transformation is exhibiting is an interesting scaling relationship between mass, kinetic energy and the size of the collapsing dust sphere.

PACS numbers: 04.20 Dw, 04.20 Ex

In classical general relativity, one of the key outstanding questions is the end result of a gravitationally collapsing object, does it end in a black hole (BH) or in a naked singularity (NS) [1, 2] ? There exists no method to address this question in general terms, and hence one is left to study various examples of collapsing systems [3] with a view to gain some insight. Recently, the most pertinent question, what is the physical process that causes NS, has also been addressed for spherical dust as well as for the general Type I matter field [4,5]. The answer is that it is the shearing force in the collapsing cloud which is responsible for NS. It has been proven that shear is necessary for NS while it has to be strong enough (beyond certain threshold value) to lead to NS.

Recently, again for a spherical dust collapse, a linear transformation has been found which keeps density and shear of the collapsing sphere invariant for all through the collapse but for the initial instant [6]. That is the initial density and shear are not invariant under this transformation. In this letter we wish to complete the invariance for initial event as well by bringing in the radius of the sphere as well to scale linearly. It is now a symmetry of the collapse dynamics and we have an equivalent set of initial data leading to the same end result as well as its evolution all through the collapse.

The inhomogeneous spherically symmetric dust collapse in n dimensions can be described by the higher dimensional Tolman-Bondi-Lemaître (TBL) line element given by

$$ds^2 = -dt^2 + \frac{R'^2}{1+f(r)}dr^2 + R^2 d\Omega_{n-2}^2, \quad (1)$$

where the area radius, $R = R(t, r)$ and $f(r) > -1$. The evolution equation for R is

$$\dot{R}^2 = \frac{F(r)}{R^{n-3}} + f(r), \quad (2)$$

where the arbitrary function $F(r) > 0$ is related to the matter density as

$$\rho(t, r) = \frac{(n-2)F'(r)}{2R^{n-2}R'}, \quad (3)$$

The measure of anisotropy is given by the shear scalar

* ujjaldebnath@yahoo.com

† subenoyc@yahoo.co.in

‡ nkd@iucaa.ernet.in

$$\sigma = \sqrt{\frac{n-2}{2(n-1)}} \left(\frac{\dot{R}'}{R'} - \frac{\dot{R}}{R} \right) = \sqrt{\frac{n-2}{8(n-1)}} \frac{[\{RF' - (n-1)R'F\} + R^{n-3}(Rf' - 2R'f)]}{R^{\frac{n-1}{2}} R' (F + fR^{n-3})^{1/2}} \quad (4)$$

Now using the initial condition $R = r$ at $t = t_i$ (initial epoch) the expressions for initial density and shear are

$$\rho_i(r) = \rho(t_i, r) = \frac{n-2}{2} r^{2-n} F'(r) \quad (5)$$

and

$$\sigma_i = \sigma(t_i, r) = \sqrt{\frac{n-2}{8(n-1)}} \frac{[rF' - (n-1)F] + r^{n-3}(rf' - 2f)}{r^{\frac{n-1}{2}} (F + fR^{n-3})^{1/2}} \quad (6)$$

For the finiteness of the initial density and shear at the centre, the regular functions F and f must have the following series expansion

$$\begin{aligned} F(r) &= F_0 r^{n-1} + F_1 r^n + F_2 r^{n+1} + \dots \quad (F_0 \neq 0) \\ f(r) &= f_0 r^2 + f_1 r^3 + f_2 r^4 + \dots \quad (f_0 \neq 0) \end{aligned} \quad (7)$$

For smooth initial density profile we write

$$\rho_i(r) = \rho_0 + \rho_1 r + \rho_2 r^2 + \dots \quad (8)$$

So using these series expansions in equation (5) we have the relation among the different coefficients as

$$\rho_j = \frac{(n+j-1)(n-2)}{2} F_j, \quad j = 0, 1, 2, \dots$$

The evolution equation (2) can be integrated to give

$$t - t_i = \frac{2}{(n-1)\sqrt{F}} \left[r^{\frac{n-1}{2}} {}_2F_1\left[\frac{1}{2}, a, a+1, -\frac{fr^{n-3}}{F}\right] - R^{\frac{n-1}{2}} {}_2F_1\left[\frac{1}{2}, a, a+1, -\frac{fR^{n-3}}{F}\right] \right] \quad (9)$$

where ${}_2F_1$ is the usual hypergeometric function with $a = \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{n-3}$.

If $t = t_s(r)$ denotes the time of collapse of the r -th shell to the singularity then $R(t_s(r), r) = 0$ and we have from the above equation

$$t_s(r) - t_i = \frac{2}{(n-1)\sqrt{F}} r^{\frac{n-1}{2}} {}_2F_1\left[\frac{1}{2}, a, a+1, -\frac{fr^{n-3}}{F}\right] \quad (10)$$

The formation of trapped surface is signaled by $R^{n-3} = F(r)$ at $t = t_{ah}(r)$ and so we write,

$$t_{ah}(r) - t_i = \frac{2r^{\frac{n-1}{2}}}{(n-1)\sqrt{F}} {}_2F_1\left[\frac{1}{2}, a, a+1, -\frac{fr^{n-3}}{F}\right] - \frac{2F^{\frac{1}{n-3}}}{n-1} {}_2F_1\left[\frac{1}{2}, a, a+1, -f\right] \quad (11)$$

Using the series expansion (7) if we proceed to the limit as $r \rightarrow 0$ in equation (10) then we have the limit of central singularity as

$$t_0 = t_i + \frac{2}{(n-1)\sqrt{F_0}} {}_2F_1\left[\frac{1}{2}, a, a+1, -\frac{f_0}{F_0}\right] \quad (12)$$

Hence the time difference between the formation of apparent horizon and central singularity is given by (upto leading order in r)

$$\begin{aligned} t_{ah} - t_0 = & -\frac{2}{n-1} F_0^{\frac{1}{n-3}} r^{\frac{n-1}{n-3}} - \frac{r}{(n-1)\sqrt{F}} \left[\frac{F_1}{F_0} {}_2F_1\left[\frac{1}{2}, a, a+1, -\frac{f_0}{F_0}\right] \right. \\ & \left. + \frac{(n-1)}{(3n-7)} \frac{f_0}{F_0} \left(\frac{f_1}{f_0} - \frac{F_1}{F_0} \right) {}_2F_1\left[\frac{3}{2}, a+1, a+2, -\frac{f_0}{F_0}\right] \right] \end{aligned} \quad (13)$$

This reduces in 4 and 5 dimensions respectively to

$$\begin{aligned} t_{ah} - t_0 = & \frac{1}{10} \left[\frac{5F_1}{f_0^{3/2}} \sinh^{-1} \sqrt{\frac{f_0}{F_0}} - \frac{5F_1 \sqrt{1 + \frac{f_0}{F_0}}}{f_0 \sqrt{F_0}} \right. \\ & \left. + \frac{2(f_0 F_1 - f_1 F_0)}{F_0^{5/2}} {}_2F_1\left[\frac{3}{2}, \frac{5}{2}, \frac{7}{2}, -\frac{f_0}{F_0}\right] \right] r + O(r^2) \end{aligned} \quad (14)$$

$$t_{ah} - t_0 = \left[\frac{(2f_1 F_0 - f_0 F_1)}{2f_0^2 \sqrt{F_0}} + \frac{(f_0 F_1 - f_0 f_1 - 2f_1 F_0)}{2f_0^2 \sqrt{F_0} \sqrt{1 + \frac{f_0}{F_0}}} \right] r + O(r^2) \quad (15)$$

Obviously it is NS when $t_{ah} > t_0$ and BH otherwise. It is the data set $\{F, f\}$ that determines the ultimate end result in terms of BH or NS for the collapsing sphere.

Mena et al [6] have proposed the following linear transformation on the data set $I = \{F, f\}$,

$$\{F, f\} \rightarrow \left\{ a^{\frac{n-1}{2}} F, af \right\} \quad (16)$$

($a > 0$ a constant) under which both ρ, σ remain invariant but not initially, i.e ρ_i, σ_i are not invariant. They have however noted that it is this discontinuous behaviour which is responsible for having NS for initially vanishing shear or density contrast. It is this discontinuity which compensates for absence of initial density contrast or shear. It is the reflection of the fact that it is always possible to generate an NS for any arbitrary density profile by suitably choosing the energy function f [7]. It is however interesting that this transformation also picks up this general aspect.

Our concern here is to seek a symmetry of the collapse dynamics - a true invariance. It stands to reason that when we linearly scale mass and energy functions, we should also scale the radius R of the sphere to keep everything in balance. The above transformation should thus be supplemented by

$$R \rightarrow \sqrt{a} R. \quad (17)$$

Now this is the symmetry of the complete collapse dynamics. It can be easily verified that the density and shear both initially as well as otherwise do remain unaltered under the transformation. Also the time difference ($t_{ah} - t_0$) remains invariant indicating the complete symmetry of the collapse process. For marginally bound collapse we can set $f = 0$

in the transformation without disturbing the invariance.

We have thus completed the linear transformation proposed by Mena et al [6] to make it as a symmetry of the collapse dynamics. What it indicates is that if we scale the radius R by α , then mass function F will naturally scale as α^{n-1} and the energy f as α^2 (dimensionally $F \rightarrow R^{(n-3)}F$). The transformation is therefore physically quite transparent but the remarkable fact is that the overall dynamics also respects it all through. This is the dynamical symmetry of spherical collapse. It is though established for the dust collapse but it should be true in general for other matter fields as well.

Acknowledgement:

One of the authors (U.D) is thankful to CSIR (Govt. of India) for awarding a Senior Research Fellowship and both SC and UD acknowledge the hospitality of IUCAA.

-
- [1] S.W. Hawking and G.F.R. Ellis, *The large scale structure of space-time* (Cambridge. Univ. Press, Cambridge, England, 1973).
 - [2] R. Penrose, *Riv. Nuovo Cimento* **1** 252 (1969); in *General Relativity*, an Einstein Centenary Volume, edited by S.W. Hawking and W. Israel (Camb. Univ. Press, Cambridge, 1979).
 - [3] For recent reviews, see, e.g. P.S. Joshi, *Pramana* **55** 529 (2000); C. Gundlach, *Living Rev. Rel.* **2** 4 (1999).
 - [4] P.S. Joshi, N. Dadhich and R. Maartens, *Phys. Rev. D* **65** 101501(R)(2002).
 - [5] P. S. Joshi, R. Goswami and N. Dadhich, *The critical role of shear in gravitational collapse - II*, gr-qc/0308012, Phys. Rev. D in press.
 - [6] F. C. Mena, B. C. Nolan and R. Tavakol, *gr-qc/0405041*.
 - [7] I.H. dwivedi and P. S. Joshi, *Class. Quant. Grav.* **14** 1223 (1997).